



Mayor

Dee Margo

City Council

District 1

Peter Svarzbein

District 2

Alexsandra Annello

District 3

Cassandra Hernandez

District 4

Dr. Sam Morgan

District 5

Isabel Salcido

District 6

Claudia Ordaz Perez

District 7

Henry Rivera

District 8

Cissy Lizarraga

City Manager

Tommy Gonzalez

HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES

FIRST FLOOR, COUNCIL CHAMBERS

CITY 1 BUILDING, 300 N. CAMPBELL STREET

JANUARY 28, 2019, 4:00 P.M.

The El Paso Historic Landmark Commission held a public hearing in the Council Chambers, City 1 Building, 300 N. Campbell Street, January 28, 2019, 4:00 p.m.

The following Commissioners were present: 7

Chairman D.J. Seigny

Vice-Chairwoman Vicki Hamilton (4:05 p.m.)

Commissioner Chris Esper

Commissioner Sherry Mowles

Commissioner Charles Stapler

Commissioner Don Luciano

Commissioner Robert Palacios

Commissioner Ivan Lopez

Commissioner Francisco Macias

Commissioners not present: 0

Vacancy: 0

The following City staff members were present:

Ms. Providencia Velázquez, Historic Preservation Officer, Planning & Inspections

Mr. Russell Abeln, Assistant City Attorney, City Attorney's office

CALL TO ORDER

Chairman Seigny called the meeting to order at 4:00 p.m., quorum present.

CALL TO THE PUBLIC

Chairman Seigny asked if anyone present would like to address the Commission on issues not posted on the agenda. *No response from the audience.*

CHANGES TO THE AGENDA

Ms. Velázquez noted the property owner for agenda item 1. was not present and suggested Commissioners begin the meeting with agenda item 2.

Planning & Inspections Department

Philip F. Etiwe, Director

City 3 | 801 Texas Ave | El Paso, Texas 79901



1. **PHAP18-00007** 18 Sunset Heights w. ½ of 1 to 5 (7788 sq. ft.), City of El Paso, El Paso County, Texas
- Location: 905 W. Yandell Drive
- Historic District: Sunset Heights
- Property Owner: Eric Albarca
- Representative: Carlos Lievanos
- Representative District: 8
- Existing Zoning: R-4/H (Residential/Historic)
- Year Built: 1923
- Historic Status: Landmark
- Request: Reconsideration of an approved Certificate of Appropriateness for the relocation of a retaining wall, removal of a portico, alteration of garage wall to accommodate a door and window, construction of a new wall and gate, construction of a new patio, painting of the building, construction of new parking spaces, and landscaping
- Application Filed: Original filing date – 03/09/18
- 45 Day Expiration: Original expiration date – 04/16/18

Ms. Velázquez gave a presentation and responded to comments and questions from Commissioners.

Ms. Velázquez read the following into the record:

*The Historic Preservation Office recommends **APPROVAL WITH MODIFICATIONS** of the proposed scope of work based on the following recommendations:*

The Design Guidelines for El Paso's Historic Districts, Sites, and Properties recommend the following:

- *The recurrent alteration of solids and voids (walls to windows and doors) in the façade of a building establishes a pattern. Architectural elements such as walls, porches, dormers, windows and doors should maintain the pattern and rhythm of the existing buildings.*
- *Construction of new fences, stairs, or sidewalk rails and replacement of older existing fences is allowed on historic properties provided that the proposed site feature is of a compatible materials and scale.*



- *Introduce new fences and walls compatible in material, design, scale, location, and size with the original fences and walls in the historic district.*
- *The height of the proposed fence should complement the structure and should not obstruct the public's view of the building. Any proposed fence higher than 32" solid or 48" open, measured from ground level, at front property line or a side yard property line on a corner lot, shall be reviewed by the HLC. Any proposed fence higher than 6 ft., between buildings on an interior property line or across the rear property line, shall be reviewed by the HLC.*
- *Windows in secondary façades shall be reviewed on a case by case basis.*
- *If it is necessary to replace masonry, always use materials that match the color, size and texture of the masonry being replaced.*
- *Previously painted surfaces that were painted prior to designation or with a permit may remain painted.*
- *When repainting, select paint colors that are compatible with the historic building and district. Enhance the features of a building through appropriate selection and placement of paint color consistent with its architectural style.*
- *New construction should utilize doors and windows of compatible size, style, and material in an appropriate pattern so as not to detract from the historical significance of the existing building.*
- *Doors and windows for new construction and additions should be compatible in proportion, location, shape, pattern, size, and details to existing units.*
- *Select appropriate materials for patios, including wood, concrete, brick and stone to match the original.*
- *Design and construct decks so that they may be removed in the future without damage to the historic structure.*
- *When new landscaping is planned, it should be designed to complement the structure and the streetscape. Materials which can be documented as being historic to the area should be given first priority.*
- *Grass and sod may be removed from front yards, side yards on a corner provided not more than 50% of the area is covered with gravel or other masonry. The remaining 50% must be covered with trees and living plants that provide ground cover.*



The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation recommend the following:

- *New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property.*
- *Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.*

THE MODIFICATIONS ARE:

- 1. THAT THE FRONT GATE BE DESIGNED AS ORIGINALLY APPROVED; AND**
- 2. THAT THE BACK WALL BE ALTERED BY USING METAL FENCING TO DETACH FROM THE EXISTING MASONRY WALLS.**

Carlos Lievanos, property owner and architect for this project, responded to comments and questions from Commissioners.

Chairman Sevigny, Vice-Chairwoman Hamilton and Commissioners Mowles, Lopez, Luciano, Macias made comments.

Russell Abeln, Assistant City Attorney, requested Commissioners keep their comments on the record when discussing between each other.

MOTION:

Motion made by Chairman Sevigny, seconded by Commissioner Luciano AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE BOTH THE PROPOSED DESIGN THAT WAS SENT TO US AS WELL AS THE MODIFICATIONS THAT PROVI RECOMMENDED WHICH WERE THE FRONT GATE BE DESIGNED AS ORIGINALLY APPROVED AND THE BACK WALL WILL BE ALTERED BY USING THE METAL FENCING TO DETACH FROM THE EXISTING MASONRY WALLS OR A COMBINATION OF THE TWO.



2. PHAP19-00003	5 ½ Mills 101.82 Ft. On San Antonio Beg. 108.29 Ft. E. Of Swc & Extending To Texas Ave 10691 Sq. Ft., City of El Paso, El Paso County, Texas
Location:	108-114 E. Texas Avenue
Historic District:	Downtown
Property Owner:	Trost Hills Building, LLC
Representative:	William C. Helm II
Representative District:	8
Existing Zoning:	C-5/H (Commercial/Historic)
Year Built:	1927
Historic Status:	Landmark
Request:	Certificate of Appropriateness for building rehabilitation to include storefront reconfiguration, lighting, entrance ramps, stairs, sidewalk, planters, murals, awnings, and construction of a five-story rooftop addition
Application Filed:	01/14/19
45 Day Expiration:	02/28/19

Ms. Velázquez gave a presentation and noted the architects for the project are Bill Helm and Edgar Lopez, in*situ Architects and former Chairman and Vice-Chairman of the Historic Landmark Commission.

*The Historic Preservation Office recommends **APPROVAL WITH A MODIFICATION** of the proposed scope of work based on the following recommendations:*

The Design Guidelines for the Downtown Historic District recommend the following:

- *Setbacks are permissible, however, if they occur after the first two stories. (The Plaza Hotel illustrates this concept).*
- *New development shall comply with the requirements for the underlying residential, apartment, or commercial zone.*
- *The relationship between the height and width of a building establishes proportion. The proportions of new buildings should be consistent with the dominant proportions of existing buildings (vertically and horizontally)*
- *Windows should be similar in size and spacing to those of the historic landmarks within each zone.*



- *San Antonio Zone: New infill construction and additions to existing structures should maintain and reinforce the existing pattern and of the Popular.*
- *Sidewalks should be enhanced by installing brick pavers (or other decorative materials) along the edges and/or at intersections.*
- *All sidewalks should have handicap accessibility.*
- *Generally, lighting provides safety and visibility. In addition, it serves a number of other purposes: Provides safe movement of vehicular and pedestrian traffic. Provides security and aids in crime prevention. Can accentuate important features, qualities, and landmarks. Allows day or night usage of buildings.*
- *With a few exceptions, the roofs within the historic district are flat and therefore are not visible from the sidewalk. Generally, if the roof of a building is not visible from the street, the use of any appropriate roofing material is acceptable.*
- *Horizontal, casement or picture windows are not historic and should be avoided.*
- *Generally, window glass should be clear. Mirrored and reflective glass are not historic and should be avoided. The same is true for any reflective-type window screening.*
- *Windows should be evenly distributed horizontally and vertically on all floors.*
- *Historically, awnings were covered with canvas. Canvas and other synthetics (woven acrylics) should be used on awnings. Shiny fabrics, however, may distract from a building's appearance and should therefore be avoided.*
- *Materials should be compatible with the structure and other elements particular to the historic district.*
- *Awnings and canopies should be placed at the top of openings, but they should not cover important architectural details/elements.*
- *Awnings and canopies should be of an appropriate size and scale in relation to the building's façade.*
- *Fixtures should not extend across the façades of several buildings. Instead, fixtures should fit within vertical elements such as columns.*
- *Awning should not cover more than one-third of the window opening. Un-proportioned awnings may appear awkward.*
- *Fixtures should always fit within their openings. Attempting to fit a square awning into a round opening (and vice-versa) should be avoided. Generally, the shape of an awning should respect the shape of the window.*



- *Colors on awnings and canopies should be considered carefully. Generally, colors should relate to a structure's overall color scheme.*
- *Adjacent awnings should not fight each other for attention by using bright colors that might overwhelm a structure and/or an entire streetscape.*
- *Street furniture should make a positive contribution to a street's image and not become another eyesore.*
- *Street furniture should be selected, placed and maintained as part of an overall design scheme.*
- *It is recommended that storefronts reflect the recessed entry typical of the one and two-part commercial type.*
- *Determine if the existing storefront is the original or a later alteration. Preserve original materials or details and the shape of original openings (otherwise the proportions of the façade will be lost). Replace missing original elements such as transom windows.*
- *Storefronts should be fabricated from wood, but metal storefronts will be acceptable provided that: The design complements the architectural style of the façade and the surrounding area. Entry doors complement the structure's architectural style.*
- *The original size, division and shape of display windows should be retained. Glass should be transparent for pedestrian viewing.*
- *Bars or offices in storefronts should use blinds or café curtains for privacy.*
- *The wainscot or panel beneath the display window should be constructed of wood or brick. Plastic and metal sidings are not historic and should be avoided.*
- *The way in which materials and finishes are combined determines much of a structure's architectural character. It is important to preserve and complement the character of historic structures through proper design and maintenance.*
- *Retain original color and texture of masonry when possible.*
- *New additions should be planned so that they are constructed to the rear of the property or on a non-character defining elevation. According to the Standards of Rehabilitation, new additions should be designed and constructed so that the character-defining features of buildings are not radically changed, obscured, damaged, or destroyed in the process of rehabilitation. Do not add on top of an original historic structure. Rather, add to a more recent addition, or start a new one-to-two story addition on the side or rear of the building.*



The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation recommend the following:

- *New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property.*
- *New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.*

THE MODIFICATION IS THAT THE EXTERIOR LIGHTS BE MOUNTED IN THE MORTAR AND NOT IN THE MASONRY.

Bill Helm, in*situ Architects, architect/property owner, gave a presentation regarding the project and responded to comments and questions from Commissioners. He stated he would following the modification of the Historic Preservation Officer.

Edgar Lopez, in*situ Architects, architect/property owner, commented and responded to questions from Commissioners.

Rida Asfahani, Root Architects, architect/property owner, remarked and responded to comments from Commissioners.

Chairman Sevigny and Commissioners Mowles and Lopez commented or asked questions.

MOTION:

Motion made by Chairman Sevigny, seconded by Commissioner Luciano **AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE THIS PROJECT WITH THE MODIFICATIONS FOR THE EXTERIOR LIGHTS TO BE MOUNTED IN THE MORTAR JOINTS AND NOT THE MASONRY UNITS THEMSELVES AND AN UNDERSTANDING FOR THE MURALS TO COME BACK FOR A SEPARATE REVIEW.**

ABSTAIN: *Commissioner Esper*



Prior to the presentation, Ms. Velázquez reiterated to Commissioners not to speak amongst themselves and if Commissioners want to have a conversation please make sure you're speaking into the microphone for the record.

3. PHAP19-00004	8 Manhattan Heights 20 & 21, City of El Paso, El Paso County, Texas
Location:	2817 Wheeling Avenue
Historic District:	Manhattan Heights
Property Owner:	Virginia Guerrero
Representative:	Santana Construction
Representative District:	2
Existing Zoning:	R-3/H (Residential/Historic)
Year Built:	1915
Historic Status:	Contributing
Request:	Certificate of Appropriateness for the modification of a window opening into a door and a door opening into a window
Application Filed:	01/14/19
45 Day Expiration:	02/28/19

Ms. Velázquez gave a presentation and responded to comments and questions from Commissioners.

Ms. Velázquez read the following recommendations into the record:

*The Historic Preservation Office recommends **APPROVAL** of the proposed scope of work based on the following recommendations:*

The Design Guidelines for El Paso's Historic Districts, Sites, and Properties recommend the following:

- The recurrent alteration of solids and voids (walls to windows and doors) in the façade of a building establishes a pattern. Architectural elements such as walls, porches, dormers, windows and doors should maintain the pattern and rhythm of the existing buildings.*
- Windows in secondary façades shall be reviewed on a case by case basis.*
- Retain and preserve the pattern, arrangement, and dimensions of door and window openings on principal elevations. Often the placement of doors and windows is an indicator of a particular architectural style, and therefore contributes to the building's significance.*



- *When repair is not feasible, door and window products will be reviewed on an individual basis using the following criteria:*
 - a. *Architectural and historical compatibility*
 - b. *Comparison to original profile*
 - c. *Level of significance of original doors and windows to the architectural style of the building.*
 - d. *Three dimensional exterior applied muntins that simulate or match the original muntins may be approved. Single dimension interior applied muntins are not appropriate.*
- *Doors and windows for new construction and additions should be compatible in proportion, location, shape, pattern, size, and details to existing units.*
- *The size of the door or window opening should not be altered.*

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation recommend the following:

- *New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property.*
- *Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.*

MOTION:

Motion made by Commissioner Luciano, seconded by Commissioner Stapler **AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE AS PRESENTED.**



4. PHAP19-00005	4 Mundy Heights 22 & 23 & E 17.90 Ft of 21 & W 15 Ft Of 24 (6205.40 Sq. Ft.), City of El Paso, El Paso County, Texas
Location:	1213 Prospect Street
Historic District:	Sunset Heights
Property Owner:	Adrian and Angelica Rodriguez
Representative:	Adrian and Angelica Rodriguez
Representative District:	8
Existing Zoning:	R-4/H (Residential/Historic)
Year Built:	1994
Historic Status:	Non-contributing
Request:	Certificate of Appropriateness for the removal of green barrel tile and replacement with green asphalt shingle
Application Filed:	01/14/19
45 Day Expiration:	02/28/19

Ms. Velázquez gave a presentation and responded to comments and questions from Commissioners.

Ms. Velázquez read the following recommendations into the record:

*The Historic Preservation Office recommends **APPROVAL WITH A MODIFICATION** of the proposed scope of work based on the following recommendations:*

The Design Guidelines for El Paso's Historic Districts, Sites, and Properties recommend the following:

- *The distinctive features of each roof type should be retained as they are character-defining elements. If a roof requires repair, the replacement materials must match the original or existing materials as closely as possible. Do not change the style or construction of the roof.*

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation recommend the following:

- *Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.*
- *Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.*

THE MODIFICATION IS THAT THE NEW ROOFING BE BARREL TILE TO MATCH THE EXISTING.



Adrian Rodriguez, property owner, gave a presentation and responded to comments and questions from Commissioners (copy of presentation on file).

Chairman Sevigny, Vice-Chairwoman Hamilton and Commissioner Mowles made comments.

MOTION:

Motion made by Commissioner Luciano, seconded by Commissioner Stapler ***AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE FOR HIM TO MODIFY IT TO THE ASPHALT SHINGLES.***

5. Addresses of property HLC Commissioners have requested that HLC staff review or investigate and provide a report to the HLC. If no addresses are submitted in advance and listed under this agenda item, Commissioners may announce such addresses under this agenda item. Discussion on property announced at this meeting will take place during the next regularly scheduled meeting. January 28, 2019 deadline for HLC members to request for agenda items to be scheduled at the February 11, 2019 meeting. February 11, 2019 deadline for HLC members to request for agenda items to be scheduled for the February 25, 2019 meeting.

No requests were made by Commissioners.

HLC Staff Report

6. Update on Administrative Review Cases since last HLC meeting for the properties listed on the attachment posted with this agenda. (See Attachment "A.")

Commissioner Luciano noted he is the property owner for 506 W. Yandell Dr.

Ms. Velázquez explained, per the El Paso Central Appraisal District, the property owner of record does not show the Commissioner's name.

MOTION:

Motion made by Chairman Stapler, seconded by Chairman Sevigny ***AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE.***



Other Business – Discussion and Action

7. Discussion and action on Regular meeting minutes for January 7, 2019.

MOTION:

Motion made by Chairman Sevigny, seconded by Commissioner Stapler ***AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE THESE MINUTES AS STATED.***

ABSTAIN: Commissioners Esper and Mowles

8. Discussion and action on Work Session meeting minutes for January 14, 2019.

Tabled to the February 11th HLC meeting.

9. Discussion and action on the amendments to Chapter 20.20 of the El Paso City Code

Ms. Velázquez has been trying to reach some people at the County to go over the ordinance and explain what is going on; however, things are moving slowly. She recommended Commissioners regroup in a couple of weeks to discuss plans.



Prior to adjourning, Commissioner Lopez requested clarification on the motion for item 1, specifically the front gate portion. Which option did we approve:

1. Organic fencing in the front; or
2. Go back to the existing approved plan.

Ms. Velázquez explained both options were approved, the one that was presented today by the owner/architect and the one that staff recommended because we don't know what the SHPO is going to approve.

MOTION:

Motion made by Chairman Sevigny, seconded by Commissioner Stapler ***AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO ADJOURN 5:51 P.M.***